

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MINUTES

DATE: APRIL 23, 2015

The City of Cincinnati's Civil Service Commission met in regular session in Room 307, City Hall on Thursday, April 23, 2015. Commissioners in attendance were Mr. James Robinson, Chair, Mr. Robert Braddock, and Mr. C. Freeman McNeal. Commission staff present included Nancy Olind, Assistant HR Director, Seeta Martindale, Recording Secretary, Human Resources Analysts: Ornita Brown, Bruce Ross, Doris Adotey, Amy Luthanen, Erica Burks, and Derrick Gentry.

AGENDA ITEMS

APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM THE 04/09/2015 MEETING. Minutes were previously routed and reviewed. Commissioner McNeal made a motion to approve the minutes. Commissioner Braddock seconded the motion and the minutes were unanimously approved.

APPOINTMENT TO THE CLASSIFIED SERVICE

Thomas Cromwell to the position of Laborer in the Parks Department. The staff provided information in accordance with Civil Service Rules for the appointment of Municipal Workers to permanent positions in the classified service. The candidate met the minimum requirements for the position, the needs of the department, and was selected from among the candidates referred to the department from a seniority list. The Commission approved this item.

Phillip Seitz to the position of Customer Relations Representative in the Health Department. This position was posted as an open-competitive exam. The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for appointment to the classified service. The candidate met the minimum requirements for the position, competed and obtained a passing grade on the exam, and was selected from among the candidates referred to the department. The Commission approved this item, pending a background check and final authorization from Employee Health Services.

Anthony Towe to the position of Automotive Mechanic in the Department of Public Services. This position was posted as an open-competitive exam. The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for appointment to the classified service. The candidate met the minimum requirements for the position, competed and obtained a passing grade on the exam, and was selected from among the candidates referred to the department from an open eligible list. The Commission approved this item.

Joshua Kellerman to the position of Automotive Mechanic in the Department of Public Services. This position was posted as an open-competitive exam. The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for appointment to the classified service. The candidate met the minimum requirements for the position, competed and obtained a passing grade on the exam, and was selected from among the candidates referred to the department from an open eligible list. The Commission approved this item.

Michael Reeves to the position of Sanitation Helper in the Department of Public Services. The staff provided information in accordance with Civil Service Rules for the appointment of Municipal Workers to permanent positions in the classified service. The

AGENDA ITEMS cont'd...

candidate met the minimum requirements for the position and was selected from among the candidates referred to the department from a seniority list. The Commission approved this item.

Karen Clark to the position of Sanitation Helper in the Department of Public Services. The staff provided information in accordance with Civil Service Rules for the appointment of Municipal Workers to permanent positions in the classified service. The candidate met the minimum requirements for the position and was selected from among the candidates referred to the department from a seniority list. The Commission approved this item.

Duane Cranmo to the position of Sanitation Helper in the Department of Public Services. The staff provided information in accordance with Civil Service Rules for the appointment of Municipal Workers to permanent positions in the classified service. The candidate met the minimum requirements for the position and was selected from among the candidates referred to the department from a seniority list. The Commission approved this item.

Michael Walker and Linda Fields to the position of Water Works Guard in the Department of Water. The staff provided information in accordance with the Civil Service rules. The candidates met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills and necessary certification, and were selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional and specialized nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointments, (pending final Employee Health Services approval for Mr. Walker).

Jessica Stone to the position of Dental Assistant in the Health Department. The staff provided information in accordance with the Civil Service rules. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills and necessary certification, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional licensure requirement and specialized nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment, pending a background check and final Employee Health Services approval.

Jennifer Morgan to the position of Dental Assistant in the Health Department. The staff provided information in accordance with the Civil Service rules. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills and necessary certification, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional licensure requirement and specialized nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

Pamela Copass to the position of Nurse Practitioner in the Health Department. The staff provided information in accordance with the Civil Service rules. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills and necessary certification, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional licensure requirement and specialized nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

AGENDA ITEMS cont'd...

Kellee Haslon to the position of Nurse Practitioner in the Health Department. The staff provided information in accordance with the Civil Service rules. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills and necessary certification, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional licensure requirement and specialized nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

Stanley Heideman to the position of Plumber in the Parks Department. The staff provided information in accordance with the Civil Service rules. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills and necessary certification, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional and specialized nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

Jeni Cullen to the position of Florist in the Parks Department. The staff provided information in accordance with the Civil Service rules. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills and necessary certification, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional and specialized nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment, pending a background check and final Employee Health Services approval.

Gerald Thomason to the position of Human Resources Analyst (HCM) in the Human Resources Department. The staff provided information in accordance with the Civil Service rules. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the specific skills needed by the department, demonstrated the additional characteristics required to serve as a confidential employee, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional and specialized nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

NOTICE OF PERSONNEL ACTION

Joseph Geil to the position of Technical Systems Analyst in the Department of Sewers. This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, was referred to the department and selected within the Collective Bargaining Agreement guidelines. The Commission noted this item.

Vanessa Henderson to the position of Service Area Coordinator in the Recreation Department. This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, competed and obtained a passing grade on the exam, was referred to the department and selected within the Collective Bargaining Agreement guidelines. The Commission noted this item.

AGENDA ITEMS cont'd...

Nathan Doyle and Robin Shafer to the position of Laboratory Technician 3 in the Department of Sewers. This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidates met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, competed and obtained passing grades on the exam, were referred to the department, and selected within the Collective Bargaining Agreement guidelines. The Commission noted this item, pending the background check for Ms. Shafer.

Marlene Fitzwater to the position of Administrative Technician in the Police Department. This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, competed and obtained a passing grade on the exam, was referred to the department, and selected within the Collective Bargaining Agreement guidelines. The Commission noted this item.

James Ramstetter and David Reiman to the position of Water Works Maintenance Field Supervisor (MSD) in the Department of Sewers. This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidates met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, competed and obtained passing grades on the exam, were referred to the department, and selected within the Collective Bargaining Agreement guidelines. The Commission noted this item.

Kimberly Haysbert to the position of Water Works Maintenance Worker in the Department of Water. This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, was referred to the department and selected within the Collective Bargaining Agreement guidelines from the eligible list. The Commission noted this item.

Kenneth Rocchio and Elmer Sargent to the position of Civil Engineering Technician 2 in the Department of Water. This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidates met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, were referred to the department, and selected within the Collective Bargaining Agreement guidelines from the eligible list. The Commission noted this item.

Cortez Fairbanks to the position of Water Works Maintenance Field Supervisor in the Department of Water. This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, competed and obtained a passing grade on the exam, was referred to the department, and was selected within the Collective Bargaining Agreement guidelines. The Commission noted this item.

Yacu Lewis to the position of Sanitation Specialist in the Public Services Department. This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, was referred to the department, and was selected within the Collective Bargaining Agreement guidelines from the eligible list. The Commission noted this item.

Sarah Sittason and Teneal Poole to the position of Emergency Services Dispatch Supervisor in the City Manager's Office/Emergency Services Center. This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidates met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, competed and obtained passing grades on the exam, were referred to the department, and were selected within the Collective Bargaining Agreement guidelines. The Commission noted this item.

AGENDA ITEMS cont'd...

REQUEST FOR PROMOTION WITHOUT EXAM

Brent Daniels to the position of Plant Operator 2 – OH CERT 3 in the Department of Sewers. The candidate met the minimum requirements for promotion having completed one year of satisfactory service in the position of Plant Operator 2, Class II (Ohio EPA Water Certification), and has received his Class III licensure from the State of Ohio Environmental Protection Agency. Based on the classification specification, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the promotion without exam.

REQUEST FOR APPROVAL OF ELIGIBLE LISTS

- a) **Plant Operator 1 (Water) and Plant Operator 1 (Wastewater).** Mr. Robert Wize was advised that, in accordance with Civil Service Rules, his name would be removed from the Plant Operator 1 (Water) and Plant Operator 1 (Wastewater) eligible lists as he was not eligible to compete in any Civil Service examinations due to a failure of probation. He did not provide notice to speak to the Commission in advance; however, he was present at the meeting and asked to address the Commission at the end of the meeting. The Commission then returned to this item so that Mr. Wize could address the Commission. AFSCME stewards Randy Rinear and Justin Barkey were also present to address Mr. Wize's concern. Mr. Rinear stated that Mr. Wize was temporarily transferred into the position that he had been previously demoted from the same day of the demotion. Mr. Rinear stated that the list in question was open to the public and that Mr. Wize is one month away from being a year past his failure of probation. Bruce Ross, Human Resources Analyst explained that Mr. Wize should not have been permitted to take the examination per the Civil Service Rule that prohibits participating in Civil Service examinations for one year from the failure of probation. Mr. Wize stated his accomplishments during his tenure with the City. The Commission noted Mr. Wize's comments and approved the revised list.
- b) **Senior Sanitarian – Promotional**
- c) **Water Customer Service Representative 2 – Promotional**
- d) **Water Works Maintenance Crew Leader – Promotional**

The Commission approved these items.

REQUEST FOR APPROVAL OF EXAM SCHEDULES

- a) **Accountant – Open**
- b) **Police Captain - Promotional**
- c) **Police Sergeant – Promotional**
- d) **Service Area Coordinator (Greenspace Coordinator/Scheduler) – Promotional**
- e) **Water Works Valve Operator 1 – Promotional**

The Commission approved these items.

April 23, 2015

AGENDA ITEMS cont'd...

REQUEST FOR APPROVAL OF SPECIAL EXAMINERS

- a) Joyce Bird for the Help Desk Technician (Board of Education)
- b) James Boyd and Shawn League for the Level 1 Building Engineer (Board of Education)

The Commission approved these items.

REQUEST FOR THE APPROVAL OF NEW AND/OR REVISED CLASSIFICATION SPECIFICATIONS

- a) Crime Analyst
- b) Senior Crime Analyst
- c) Electrical Maintenance Worker 3 (High Voltage)
- d) Recreation Director

The Commission approved these items.

CLASSIFICATION: Request from Departments to add/delete positions to their table of organization

- a) **Enterprise Technology Solutions Department:** Add (1) Information Technology Assistant Manager (Business Analytics). Delete (1) Computer Systems Analyst and (1) Radio Operator Technician 2
- b) **Department of Public Services:** Add (1) Assistant Supervisor of Fleet Services. Delete (1) Automotive Mechanic Crew Chief
- c) **Finance Department:** Add (3) Division Managers. Delete (2) Supervising Accountants and (1) Supervising Management Analyst
- d) **Parks Department:** Add (5) Program Leaders, (6) Recreation Specialists and (5) Municipal Workers
- e) **Department of Trade and Development:** Add (2) Division Managers and (2) Deputy Directors

The Commission approved these items.

APPEAL TO THE COMMISSION: Information Items

- a) Appeal Hearing Schedule

Name	Scheduled for:
David Johnson	Hearing Scheduled for May 28, 2015
Richard Johnson	April 23, 2015 Hearing Cancelled/New Hearing Date to be Scheduled
Phillip Jones	Hearing Scheduled for May 14, 2015
Robert DeBonis	Subpoenaed Documents Delivered/Re-Scheduling pending acquisition of additional documents by Appellant
Banita Bell (Board of Education)	Hearing Scheduled for July 23, 2015

The Commission noted this item.

AGENDA ITEMS cont'd...

The Commission Staff provided notice of a letter from Anthony Axle withdrawing his appeal to the Civil Service Commission in the matter of his dismissal from the Department of Water. The Civil Service Commission is in receipt of a letter of withdrawal to the July 18, 2013 appeal hearing of Anthony Axle. Mr. Axle indicated in his letter that all matters relative to the dismissal had been resolved and the appeal is therefore moot. A settlement document between Mr. Axle and the City was also submitted for the record.

APPLICATION FOR ENTRANCE EXAM APPEALS

Request from Tanya Brown-Morrow to appeal the rejection of her application for the position of Medical Assistant. Mr. Brown-Morrow was present at the meeting and stated that she did not attach the required information, either through user-error or web-error, but that she possessed proof of the required qualifications at the time of her application. Doris Adotey, Human Resources Analyst, explained that the application was rejected as the job posting stated that required documents be uploaded as part of the application process. Commissioner Robinson pointed out the location of this statement on the job posting to Ms. Brown-Morrow. The Commission denied the request.

REQUEST TO THE COMMISSION

Request from Jeseca Davis to appear before the Commission regarding the rejection of her transfer application for the position of Administrative Technician. Ms. Davis was present at the meeting and stated that other employees within her classification had been permitted to apply and interview for transfer positions with the title of Administrative Technician. Ms. Davis wanted to understand why she was not permitted to remain in the transfer process. Amy Luthanen, Human Resources Analyst, reported that there had been other applicants rejected for transfer based on review of the classifications for other postings. Commissioner Robinson asked if the posting included her classification as an option for transfer. Ms. Davis confirmed it was not. The Commission noted her concerns.

Request from Sheila Bond to appear before the Commission regarding the rejection of her transfer application for the position of Administrative Technician. Ms. Bond was not present at the meeting. Commission staff provided information submitted by the applicant pertaining to the request. The Commission noted this item.

Request from Joehonny Reese to appear before the Commission regarding signing up electronically for the Police Sergeant examination. Mr. Reese was present at the meeting and stated that his email had been non-operational since early 2015 and he was unaware of the sign-up opportunity for the Sergeant examination. The Commission noted his statements.

Request from Huse Wright for a review of duties performed by Brenda Dixon within the Enterprise Technologies Solutions Department. Mr. Wright was not present at the meeting. Commission staff provided information submitted by Mr. Huse pertaining to the request and the Civil Services Rules guiding which parties may be eligible to request an audit of a position. The Commission noted this item.

AGENDA ITEMS cont'd...

Request for addition to feeder classification to the Administrative Technician classification specification. Commission staff submitted a letter submitted by Pharmacy Technicians from the Health Department requesting that their classification be added to the feeder pool for Administrative Technician examinations. Nancy Olind, Assistant Human Resources Director, stated the classification of Pharmacy Technician is within a specialized series related to the Pharmacy industry, and while not in the present feeder pool, Pharmacy Technicians do have the opportunity to sit for this exam by qualifying via the education option of successful completion of 45 credit hours at an accredited college or university within the course areas outlined in the Administrative Technician classification specification. The Commission noted this item.

INFORMATION ITEMS

Legal Opinion on Political Activity by City Employees. The Commission noted that it had received the legal opinion formally requested from the City's Law Department on the matter of employees participating in political activity and that this information had been disseminated by Commission staff to the employee(s).

The legal representatives of the Cincinnati Organization of Dedicated Employees (CODE) Bargaining Unit have requested to address each item on the agenda per Civil Service Rule 2, Section 5. CODE representatives were not present at the meeting. The Commission noted the request to address all items as waived.